

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

<b>IN RE: ETHICON, INC. PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION</b>	<b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL No. 2327</b>
<b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:</b>  <b>WAVE 4 CASES ON ATTACHED EXHIBIT A</b>	<b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>

**PLAINTIFFS' DAUBERT MOTION TO PRECLUDE OR, IN THE ALTERNATIVE, TO  
LIMIT THE OPINIONS AND TESTIMONY OF SARAH ABBIE COLLINS, M.D.**

**COMES NOW** Plaintiffs in actions listed on attached Exhibit A, by and through the undersigned attorneys, and files this Plaintiffs' *Daubert* Motion to Exclude or, In The Alternative, To Limit The Opinions And Testimony Of Sarah Collins, M.D. and would respectfully show the Court that Dr. Collins should be excluded for the following reasons:

1. Dr. Collins is not qualified to offer general opinions on the design or warnings for the TVT or TVT-Exact mesh devices, based on Dr. Collins' admission that her opinions are offered without reference to any objective, verifiable standards, and are limited to what is adequate for her, in her own practice. Dr. Collins is unfamiliar with any objective standards, from Ethicon or elsewhere, and failed to apply any such standards to her opinions. Finally, Dr. Collins does not have knowledge of internal Ethicon standards, internal documents, or testimony, so her testimony would be disconnected from much of the evidence to be considered by the jury.
2. In support of this motion, Plaintiff has submitted a memorandum of law and also relies upon the following attached exhibits:

1. A true copy of the Wave 4 Expert Report of Sarah Collins, M.D. TVT and TVT-Exact is attached hereto as Exhibit B.
2. A true copy of the Curriculum Vitae of Sarah Collins, M.D. is attached hereto as Exhibit C.
3. A true copy of excerpts from the Deposition of Dr. Sarah Collins dated March 6, 2017 is attached hereto as Exhibit D.
4. A true copy of excerpts from the September 12, 2012 deposition of Dr. Charlotte Owens, is attached hereto as Exhibit E.
5. A true copy of excerpts from the July 25, 2013 deposition of Dr. David Brown Robinson is attached hereto as Exhibit F.
6. A true copy of excerpts from the May 18, 2012 deposition of Sean M. O'Bryan is attached hereto as Exhibit G.

WHEREFORE, PREMISES CONSIDERED, Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court grant their *Daubert* Motion to Exclude or, In The Alternative, To Limit The Opinions And Testimony Of Sarah Collins, M.D. Additionally, Plaintiffs request all other and further relief to which they may be justly entitled.

Dated: April 13, 2017

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Bryan F. Aylstock  
Bryan F. Aylstock, Esq.  
Renee Baggett, Esq.  
Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis and Overholtz, PLC  
17 East Main Street, Suite 200  
Pensacola, Florida 32563  
(850) 202-1010  
(850) 916-7449 (fax)  
[rbaggett@awkolaw.com](mailto:rbaggett@awkolaw.com)  
[baylstock@awkolaw.com](mailto:baylstock@awkolaw.com)  
*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I filed the foregoing document on April 13, 2017, using the Court's CM-ECF filing system, thereby sending notice of the filing to all counsel of record in this matter.

/s/ Bryan F. Aylstock \_\_\_\_\_  
Bryan F. Aylstock, Esq.  
Renee Baggett, Esq.  
Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis and Overholtz, PLC  
17 East Main Street, Suite 200  
Pensacola, Florida 32563  
(850) 202-1010  
(850) 916-7449 (fax)  
[rbaggett@awkolaw.com](mailto:rbaggett@awkolaw.com)  
[baylstock@awkolaw.com](mailto:baylstock@awkolaw.com)